



On globally asymptotic stability of a fourth-order rational difference equation



Lama Sh. Aljoufi^{a,b,*}, A. M. Ahmed^c, Samir Al Mohammady^{d,e}

^aDeanship of Common First Year, Jouf University, P.O. Box 2014, Sakaka, Jouf, Saudi Arabia.

^bBasic Sciences Research Unit, Jouf University, P.O. Box 2014, Sakaka, Jouf, Saudi Arabia.

^cDepartment of Mathematics, Faculty of Science, Al Azhar University, Nasr City 11884, Cairo, Egypt.

^dDepartment of Mathematics, College of Science, Jouf University, P.O. Box 2014, Sakaka, Jouf, Saudi Arabia.

^eDepartment of Mathematics, Faculty of Science, Helwan University, Helwan 11795, Egypt.

Abstract

In this paper, we investigate the behavior of solutions of the difference equation

$$x_{n+1} = \frac{\alpha(x_{n-2} + x_{n-3}) + (\alpha - 1)x_{n-2}x_{n-3}}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha}, \quad n = 0, 1, 2, \dots,$$

where the initial conditions $x_{-3}, x_{-2}, x_{-1}, x_0$ are arbitrary non-negative real numbers and the parameter $\alpha \in [1, \infty)$. More precisely, we study the boundedness, stability, and oscillation of the solutions of this equation.

Keywords: Difference equations, stability, oscillation.

2020 MSC: 39A10, 39A21, 39A30.

©2022 All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

The theory of difference equations is a very rich research field. It was appeared already at the beginning of the last century in intensive works by the authors. A few years ago, the classes of difference equations attracted much attention. They have been the object of some intensive studies by many authors. The theory of these types of equations was one of the most important concepts in mathematics and appears naturally in numerous scientific problems that have been widely applied in discretization methods for differential equations, population biology, medicine, economic, physics, probability theory, genetics, psychology. Very recently, the study of nonlinear difference equations has been a lot of interest

*Corresponding author

Email addresses: lamashuja11@gmail.com (Lama Sh. Aljoufi), ahmedelkb@yahoo.com (A. M. Ahmed), senssar@ju.edu.sa & drsamirhnk@gmail.com (Samir Al Mohammady)

doi: [10.22436/jmcs.027.02.07](https://doi.org/10.22436/jmcs.027.02.07)

Received: 2021-10-23 Revised: 2021-11-08 Accepted: 2021-12-08

in studying the global attractivity, boundedness character, periodicity and the solution form. For example, Abu-Saris et al. [2] investigated the asymptotic stability of the difference equation

$$x_{n+1} = \frac{a + x_n x_{n-k}}{x_n + x_{n-k}}, \quad n = 0, 1, 2, \dots,$$

where k is a nonnegative integer, $a \geq 0$ and $x_{-k}, \dots, x_0 > 0$.

Ahmed [4] investigated the behavior of solutions of the difference equation

$$x_{n+1} = \frac{a + x_{n-1} x_{n-k}}{x_{n-1} + x_{n-k}}, \quad n = 0, 1, 2, \dots,$$

where $k \in \{1, 2\}$, $a \geq 0$ and $x_{-j} > 0$, $j = 0, 1, \dots, k$.

Aljoufi et al [15] investigated the behavior of solutions of the difference equation

$$x_{n+1} = \frac{\alpha(x_{n-1} + x_{n-2}) + (\alpha - 1)x_{n-1}x_{n-2}}{x_{n-1}x_{n-2} + \alpha}, \quad n = 0, 1, 2, \dots,$$

where x_{-2}, x_{-1}, x_0 are arbitrary non-negative real numbers and the parameter $\alpha \in [1, \infty)$.

Ma [14] investigated the global asymptotic stability for the higher-order difference equation

$$z_{n+1} = \frac{c(z_n + z_{n-k}) + (c - 1)z_n z_{n-k}}{z_n z_{n-k} + c}, \quad n = 0, 1, 2, \dots,$$

with positive initial values $z_{-k}, z_{-k+1}, \dots, z_0$ and $c \in [1, \infty)$. For other related results, see [1, 3, 5–13, 16–18].

In this paper, we investigate the behavior of solutions of the difference equation

$$x_{n+1} = \frac{\alpha(x_{n-2} + x_{n-3}) + (\alpha - 1)x_{n-2}x_{n-3}}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha}, \quad n = 0, 1, 2, \dots,$$

where the initial conditions $x_{-3}, x_{-2}, x_{-1}, x_0$ are arbitrary non-negative real numbers and the parameter $\alpha \in [1, \infty)$. We need the following definitions.

Definition 1.1. Let I be an interval of real numbers and let

$$f : I^{k+1} \rightarrow I$$

be a continuously differentiable function. Consider the difference equation

$$x_{n+1} = f(x_n, x_{n-1}, \dots, x_{n-k}), \quad n = 0, 1, \dots, \quad (1.1)$$

with $x_{-k}, x_{-k+1}, \dots, x_0 \in I$. Let \bar{x} be the equilibrium point of (1.1). The linearized equation of (1.1) about the equilibrium point \bar{x} is

$$y_{n+1} = c_1 y_n + c_2 y_{n-1} + \dots + c_{k+1} y_{n-k}, \quad (1.2)$$

where $c_1 = \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_n}(\bar{x}, \bar{x}, \dots, \bar{x})$, $c_2 = \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_{n-1}}(\bar{x}, \bar{x}, \dots, \bar{x})$, \dots , $c_{k+1} = \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_{n-k}}(\bar{x}, \bar{x}, \dots, \bar{x})$.

The characteristic equation of (1.2) is

$$\lambda^{k+1} - \sum_{i=1}^{k+1} c_i \lambda^{k-i+1} = 0. \quad (1.3)$$

Definition 1.2. Let \bar{x} be the equilibrium point of (1.1).

- (i) The equilibrium point \bar{x} of (1.1) is called locally stable if for every $\epsilon > 0$, there exists $\delta > 0$ such that for all $x_{-k}, x_{-k+1}, \dots, x_{-1}, x_0 \in I$ with

$$|x_{-k} - \bar{x}| + |x_{-k+1} - \bar{x}| + \dots + |x_0 - \bar{x}| < \delta,$$

we have

$$|x_n - \bar{x}| < \epsilon \quad \text{for all } n \geq -k.$$

- (ii) The equilibrium point \bar{x} of (1.1) is called locally asymptotically stable if \bar{x} is locally stable and there exists $\gamma > 0$, such that for all $x_{-k}, x_{-k+1}, \dots, x_{-1}, x_0 \in I$ with

$$|x_{-k} - \bar{x}| + |x_{-k+1} - \bar{x}| + \dots + |x_0 - \bar{x}| < \gamma,$$

we have

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = \bar{x}.$$

- (iii) The equilibrium point \bar{x} of is called global attractor if for all $x_{-k}, x_{-k+1}, \dots, x_{-1}, x_0 \in I$, we have

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = \bar{x}.$$

- (iv) The equilibrium point \bar{x} of (1.1) is called globally asymptotically stable if \bar{x} is locally stable, and \bar{x} is also a global attractor of (1.1).

- (v) The equilibrium point \bar{x} of (1.1) is called unstable if \bar{x} is not locally stable.

Definition 1.3. A positive semicycle of $\{x_n\}_{n=-k}^{\infty}$ of (1.1) consists of a ‘string’ of terms $\{x_l, x_{l+1}, \dots, x_m\}$, all greater than or equal to \bar{x} , with $l \geq -k$ and $m \leq \infty$ and such that either $l = -k$ or $l > -k$ and $x_{l-1} < \bar{x}$ and either $m = \infty$ or $m < \infty$ and $x_{m+1} < \bar{x}$.

A negative semicycle of $\{x_n\}_{n=-k}^{\infty}$ of (1.1) consists of a ‘string’ of terms $\{x_l, x_{l+1}, \dots, x_m\}$, all less than \bar{x} , with $l \geq -k$ and $m \leq \infty$ and such that either $l = -k$ or $l > -k$ and $x_{l-1} \geq \bar{x}$ and either $m = \infty$ or $m < \infty$ and $x_{m+1} \geq \bar{x}$.

Definition 1.4. A solution $\{x_n\}_{n=-k}^{\infty}$ of (1.1) is called nonoscillatory if there exists $N \geq -k$ such that either

$$x_n \geq \bar{x}, \forall n \geq N \quad \text{or} \quad x_n < \bar{x}, \forall n \geq N,$$

and it is called oscillatory if it is not nonoscillatory.

We need the following theorem.

Theorem 1.5 ([1]).

- (i) If all roots of (1.3) have absolute value less than one, then the equilibrium point \bar{x} of (1.1) is locally asymptotically stable.
- (ii) If at least one of the roots of (1.3) has absolute value greater than one, then the equilibrium point \bar{x} of (1.1) is unstable.

Definition 1.6. A positive semicycle of a solution $\{x_n\}$ of (1.1) is a ‘string’ of terms $\{x_l, x_{l+1}, \dots, x_m\}$, all greater than or equal to \bar{x} , with $l \geq -k$ and $m \leq \infty$ and such that

$$\text{either } l = -k \text{ or } l > -k \text{ and } x_{l-1} < \bar{x},$$

and

$$\text{either } m = \infty \text{ or } m < \infty \text{ and } x_{m+1} < \bar{x}.$$

A negative semicycle of a solution $\{x_n\}$ of (1.1) consists of a ‘string’ of terms $\{x_l, x_{l+1}, \dots, x_m\}$, all less than \bar{x} , with $l \geq -k$ and $m \leq \infty$ and such that

$$\text{either } l = -k \text{ or } l > -k \text{ and } x_{l-1} \geq \bar{x},$$

and

$$\text{either } m = \infty \text{ or } m < \infty \text{ and } x_{m+1} \geq \bar{x}.$$

2. Main results

In this section, we investigate the behavior of solutions of equation

$$x_{n+1} = \frac{\alpha(x_{n-2} + x_{n-3}) + (\alpha - 1)x_{n-2}x_{n-3}}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha}, \quad n = 0, 1, 2, \dots, \quad (2.1)$$

where the initial conditions $x_{-3}, x_{-2}, x_{-1}, x_0$ are arbitrary non-negative real numbers and the parameter $\alpha \in [1, \infty)$. More precisely, we study the boundedness, stability, and oscillation of the solutions of (2.1).

Theorem 2.1. (2.1) has two non-negative equilibrium points $\bar{x}_1 = 0$ and $\bar{x}_2 = \alpha$.

Proof. From (2.1), we can write

$$\bar{x} = \frac{2\alpha\bar{x} + (\alpha - 1)\bar{x}^2}{\bar{x}^2 + \alpha},$$

then we have

$$\bar{x}_1 = 0 \text{ and } \bar{x}_2 = \alpha.$$

□

Theorem 2.2. The equilibrium point $\bar{x}_1 = 0$ of (2.1) is unstable equilibrium point.

Proof. The linearized equation of (2.1) about the equilibrium point $\bar{x}_1 = 0$ is

$$y_{n+1} = y_{n-2} + y_{n-3}, \quad (2.2)$$

and so the characteristic equation of (2.2) about the equilibrium point $\bar{x}_1 = 0$ is

$$\lambda^4 - \lambda - 1 = 0.$$

Suppose that

$$f(\lambda) = \lambda^4 - \lambda - 1.$$

It is clear that $f(\lambda)$ has a root in the interval $(1, \infty)$ and so $\bar{x}_1 = 0$ is an unstable equilibrium point. This completes the proof. □

Theorem 2.3. The equilibrium point $\bar{x}_2 = \alpha$ of (2.1) is locally asymptotically stable.

Proof. The linearized equation of (2.1) about the equilibrium point $\bar{x}_2 = \alpha$ is

$$y_{n+1} = 0, \quad (2.3)$$

and so the characteristic equation of (2.3) about the equilibrium point $\bar{x}_2 = \alpha$ is

$$\lambda^4 = 0,$$

which implies that $|\lambda_1| = |\lambda_2| = |\lambda_3| = |\lambda_4| = 0 < 1$, from which the proof is completed. □

Lemma 2.4. The following identities are true

$$(1) \quad x_{n+1} - \alpha = \frac{-(x_{n-2} - \alpha)(x_{n-3} - \alpha)}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha}, \text{ for } n \geq 0. \quad (2.4)$$

$$(2) \quad x_{n+3} - x_n = \frac{x_{n-1}(1 + x_n)(\alpha - x_n)}{x_n x_{n-1} + \alpha}, \text{ for } n \geq 0. \quad (2.5)$$

$$(3) \quad x_{n+4} - x_n = \frac{x_{n+1}(1+x_n)(\alpha-x_n)}{x_n x_{n-1} + \alpha}, \text{ for } n \geq 0. \quad (2.6)$$

$$(4) \quad x_{n+1} - x_{n-2} = \frac{x_{n-3}(1+x_{n-2})(\alpha-x_{n-2})}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha}, \text{ for } n \geq 0. \quad (2.7)$$

$$(5) \quad x_{n+1} - x_{n-3} = \frac{x_{n-2}(1+x_{n-3})(\alpha-x_{n-3})}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha}, \text{ for } n \geq 0. \quad (2.8)$$

$$(6) \quad x_{n+1} - x_{n-5} = \frac{(\alpha-x_{n-5})(1+x_{n-5})(x_{n-3}x_{n-6}(\alpha-1) + \alpha(x_{n-3} + x_{n-6}))}{(x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha)(x_{n-5}x_{n-6} + \alpha)}, \text{ for } n \geq 3. \quad (2.9)$$

$$(7) \quad x_{n+1} - x_{n-6} = \frac{(\alpha-x_{n-6})(1+x_{n-6})(x_{n-3}x_{n-5}(\alpha-1) + \alpha(x_{n-3} + x_{n-5}))}{(x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha)(x_{n-5}x_{n-6} + \alpha)}, \text{ for } n \geq 3. \quad (2.10)$$

$$(8) \quad x_{n+1} - x_{n-7} = \frac{(\alpha-x_{n-7})(1+x_{n-7})(x_{n-2}x_{n-6}(\alpha-1) + \alpha(x_{n-2} + x_{n-6}))}{(x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha)(x_{n-6}x_{n-7} + \alpha)}, \text{ for } n \geq 4. \quad (2.11)$$

Proof.

$$(1) \quad x_{n+1} - \alpha = \frac{\alpha(x_{n-2} + x_{n-3}) + (\alpha-1)x_{n-2}x_{n-3}}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha} - \alpha = \frac{-(x_{n-2} - \alpha)(x_{n-3} - \alpha)}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha}, \text{ for } n \geq 0.$$

$$(2) \quad x_{n+3} - x_n = \frac{\alpha(x_n + x_{n-1}) + (\alpha-1)x_n x_{n-1}}{x_n x_{n-1} + \alpha} - x_n = \frac{x_{n-1}(1+x_n)(\alpha-x_n)}{x_n x_{n-1} + \alpha}, \text{ for } n \geq 0.$$

$$(3) \quad x_{n+4} - x_n = \frac{\alpha(x_{n+1} + x_n) + (\alpha-1)x_{n+1}x_n}{x_{n+1}x_n + \alpha} - x_n = \frac{x_{n+1}(1+x_n)(\alpha-x_n)}{x_n x_{n+1} + \alpha}, \text{ for } n \geq 0.$$

$$(4) \quad x_{n+1} - x_{n-2} = \frac{\alpha(x_{n-2} + x_{n-3}) + (\alpha-1)x_{n-2}x_{n-3}}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha} - x_{n-2} = \frac{x_{n-3}(1+x_{n-2})(\alpha-x_{n-2})}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha}, \text{ for } n \geq 0.$$

$$(5) \quad x_{n+1} - x_{n-3} = \frac{\alpha(x_{n-2} + x_{n-3}) + (\alpha-1)x_{n-2}x_{n-3}}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha} - x_{n-3} = \frac{x_{n-2}(1+x_{n-3})(\alpha-x_{n-3})}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha}, \text{ for } n \geq 0.$$

$$(6) \quad \begin{aligned} x_{n+1} - x_{n-5} &= \frac{\alpha(x_{n-2} + x_{n-3}) + (\alpha-1)x_{n-2}x_{n-3}}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha} - x_{n-5} \\ &= \frac{(\alpha-x_{n-5})(1+x_{n-5})(x_{n-3}x_{n-6}(\alpha-1) + \alpha(x_{n-3} + x_{n-6}))}{(x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha)(x_{n-5}x_{n-6} + \alpha)}, \text{ for } n \geq 3. \end{aligned}$$

(7)

$$\begin{aligned} x_{n+1} - x_{n-6} &= \frac{\alpha(x_{n-2} + x_{n-3}) + (\alpha - 1)x_{n-2}x_{n-3}}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha} - x_{n-6} \\ &= \frac{(\alpha - x_{n-6})(1 + x_{n-6})(x_{n-3}x_{n-5}(\alpha - 1) + \alpha(x_{n-3} + x_{n-5}))}{(x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha)(x_{n-5}x_{n-6} + \alpha)}, \text{ for } n \geq 3. \end{aligned}$$

(8)

$$\begin{aligned} x_{n+1} - x_{n-7} &= \frac{\alpha(x_{n-2} + x_{n-3}) + (\alpha - 1)x_{n-2}x_{n-3}}{x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha} - x_{n-7} \\ &= \frac{(\alpha - x_{n-7})(1 + x_{n-7})(x_{n-2}x_{n-6}(\alpha - 1) + \alpha(x_{n-2} + x_{n-6}))}{(x_{n-2}x_{n-3} + \alpha)(x_{n-6}x_{n-7} + \alpha)}, \text{ for } n \geq 4. \end{aligned}$$

Then, the proof is completed. \square

Theorem 2.5. Let $\{x_n\}_{n=-3}^{\infty}$ be a solution of (2.1). Then the following statements are true.

- (i) If $x_{n_0} = \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, for some $n_0 \in \{-2, -1, 0, 1, 2, \dots\}$, then $x_n = \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, for all $n \geq n_0 + 6$. Also if $x_{-3} = \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, then $x_n = \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, for all $n \geq 7$.
- (ii) If $x_{n_0}, x_{n_0+1}, x_{n_0+2}, x_{n_0+3} < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, for some $n_0 \in \{-3, -2, -1, 0, 1, 2, \dots\}$, then $x_n < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, for all $n \geq n_0$.
- (iii) If (i) and (ii) are not satisfied, then $\{x_n\}_{n=-3}^{\infty}$ oscillates about $\bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, with positive semicycles of length at most four, and negative semicycles of length at most three.

Proof.

(i) Let $x_{n_0} = \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, for some $n_0 \in \{-2, -1, 0, 1, 2, \dots\}$. Then from (2.4) we have $x_n = \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, for all $n \geq n_0 + 6$.

If $x_{-3} = \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, then from (2.4) we have $x_1 = \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, which implies that $x_n = \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, for all $n \geq 7$.

(ii) Let $x_{n_0}, x_{n_0+1}, x_{n_0+2}, x_{n_0+3} < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, for some $n_0 \in \{-3, -2, -1, 0, 1, 2, \dots\}$. Then from (2.4) we have $x_n < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, for all $n \geq n_0$.

(iii) Suppose without loss of generality that there exists $n_0 \in \{-3, -2, -1, 0, 1, 2, \dots\}$, such that $x_{n_0}, x_{n_0+1}, x_{n_0+2}, x_{n_0+3} > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$. Then from (2.4) we have $x_{n_0+4}, x_{n_0+5}, x_{n_0+6} < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, $x_{n_0+7} > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, $x_{n_0+8}, x_{n_0+9} < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, $x_{n_0+10}, x_{n_0+11} > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, $x_{n_0+12} < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, $x_{n_0+13} > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, $x_{n_0+14} < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$ and $x_{n_0+15}, x_{n_0+16}, x_{n_0+17}, x_{n_0+18} > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$. The proofs of the other possibilities are similar, and will be omitted. \square

Theorem 2.6. The equilibrium point $\bar{x}_2 = \alpha$ of (2.1) is globally asymptotically stable.

Proof. We know by Theorem 2.3 that the equilibrium point $\bar{x}_2 = \alpha$ of (2.1) is locally asymptotically stable, and so it suffices to show that $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$. If there exists $n_0 \in \{-3, -2, -1, 0, 1, 2, \dots\}$, such that $x_{n_0} = \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, then from Theorem 2.5 we have $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$. Also, if $x_{-3}, x_{-2}, x_{-1}, x_0 < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, then by Theorem 2.5 we have $x_n < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, for all $n \geq -3$ and from (2.4), we have $x_{n+3} > x_n$, for $n \geq 0$. So the subsequences $\{x_{3n}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$, $\{x_{3n+1}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ and $\{x_{3n+2}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ are increasing and bounded, which implies that the subsequence $\{x_{3n}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ converges to a limit (say $M_0 > 0$). The subsequence $\{x_{3n+1}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ converges to a limit (say $M_1 > 0$) and the subsequence $\{x_{3n+2}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ converges to a limit (say $M_2 > 0$)

$$\begin{aligned} M_0 &= \frac{\alpha(M_0 + M_2) + (\alpha - 1)M_0M_2}{M_0M_2 + \alpha}, \\ M_1 &= \frac{\alpha(M_0 + M_1) + (\alpha - 1)M_0M_1}{M_0M_1 + \alpha}, \\ M_2 &= \frac{\alpha(M_1 + M_2) + (\alpha - 1)M_1M_2}{M_1M_2 + \alpha}, \end{aligned}$$

which implies that either $M_0 = M_1 = M_2 = -1$, $M_0 = M_1 = M_2 = 0$, or $M_0 = M_1 = M_2 = \alpha$. Since $M_0 = M_1 = M_2 > 0$, then $M_0 = M_1 = M_2 = \alpha$.

Now, Suppose that $x_{-3}, x_{-2}, x_{-1}, x_0 > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, then from (2.5), (2.7), and (2.8) we have $\alpha < \dots < x_{30} < x_{15} < x_0$, and so the sequence $\{x_{15n}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is decreasing and bounded, which implies that the sequence $\{x_{15n}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ converges to a limit (say $L_0 > 0$).

For the sequence $\{x_{15n+1}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$, we have from (2.4) that $0 < x_1 < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, and from (2.8) and (2.10) we have $0 < x_1 < x_{16} < x_{31} < \dots < \alpha$, and so the sequence $\{x_{15n+1}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is increasing and bounded, which implies that the sequence $\{x_{15n+1}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ converges to a limit (say $L_1 > 0$).

Similarly from (2.4)-(2.11), we have the following results.

- The sequence $\{x_{15n+2}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is increasing and bounded, and so converges to a limit (say $L_2 > 0$).
- The sequence $\{x_{15n+3}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is increasing and bounded, and so converges to a limit (say $L_3 > 0$).
- The sequence $\{x_{15n+4}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is decreasing and bounded, and so converges to a limit (say $L_4 > 0$).
- The sequence $\{x_{15n+5}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is increasing and bounded, and so converges to a limit (say $L_5 > 0$).
- The sequence $\{x_{15n+6}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is increasing and bounded, and so converges to a limit (say $L_6 > 0$).
- The sequence $\{x_{15n+7}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is decreasing and bounded, and so converges to a limit (say $L_7 > 0$).
- The sequence $\{x_{15n+8}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is decreasing and bounded, and so converges to a limit (say $L_8 > 0$).
- The sequence $\{x_{15n+9}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is increasing and bounded, and so converges to a limit (say $L_9 > 0$).
- The sequence $\{x_{15n+10}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is decreasing and bounded, and so converges to a limit (say $L_{10} > 0$).
- The sequence $\{x_{15n+11}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is increasing and bounded, and so converges to a limit (say $L_{11} > 0$).
- The sequence $\{x_{15n-3}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is decreasing and bounded, and so converges to a limit (say $L_{12} > 0$).
- The sequence $\{x_{15n-2}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is decreasing and bounded, and so converges to a limit (say $L_{13} > 0$).
- The sequence $\{x_{15n-1}\}_{n=0}^{\infty}$ is decreasing and bounded, and so converges to a limit (say $L_{14} > 0$).

So we have from (2.1) that

$$\begin{aligned}
 L_0 &= \frac{\alpha(L_{11} + L_{12}) + (\alpha - 1)L_{11}L_{12}}{L_{11}L_{12} + \alpha}, & L_1 &= \frac{\alpha(L_{12} + L_{13}) + (\alpha - 1)L_{12}L_{13}}{L_{12}L_{13} + \alpha}, \\
 L_2 &= \frac{\alpha(L_{13} + L_{14}) + (\alpha - 1)L_{13}L_{14}}{L_{13}L_{14} + \alpha}, & L_3 &= \frac{\alpha(L_0 + L_{14}) + (\alpha - 1)L_0L_{14}}{L_0L_{14} + \alpha}, \\
 L_4 &= \frac{\alpha(L_0 + L_1) + (\alpha - 1)L_0L_1}{L_0L_1 + \alpha}, & L_5 &= \frac{\alpha(L_1 + L_2) + (\alpha - 1)L_1L_2}{L_1L_2 + \alpha}, \\
 L_6 &= \frac{\alpha(L_2 + L_3) + (\alpha - 1)L_2L_3}{L_2L_3 + \alpha}, & L_7 &= \frac{\alpha(L_3 + L_4) + (\alpha - 1)L_3L_4}{L_3L_4 + \alpha}, \\
 L_8 &= \frac{\alpha(L_4 + L_5) + (\alpha - 1)L_4L_5}{L_4L_5 + \alpha}, & L_9 &= \frac{\alpha(L_5 + L_6) + (\alpha - 1)L_5L_6}{L_5L_6 + \alpha}, \\
 L_{10} &= \frac{\alpha(L_6 + L_7) + (\alpha - 1)L_6L_7}{L_6L_7 + \alpha}, & L_{11} &= \frac{\alpha(L_7 + L_8) + (\alpha - 1)L_7L_8}{L_7L_8 + \alpha}, \\
 L_{12} &= \frac{\alpha(L_8 + L_9) + (\alpha - 1)L_8L_9}{L_8L_9 + \alpha}, & L_{13} &= \frac{\alpha(L_9 + L_{10}) + (\alpha - 1)L_9L_{10}}{L_9L_{10} + \alpha}, \\
 L_{14} &= \frac{\alpha(L_{10} + L_{11}) + (\alpha - 1)L_{10}L_{11}}{L_{10}L_{11} + \alpha},
 \end{aligned}$$

Since $L_i > 0, i = 0, 1, \dots, 14$, so the only possible solution of this system in both two cases is $L_i = \alpha, i = 0, 1, \dots, 14$, and so we have $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$.

The proofs for the other cases $x_{-3}, x_{-2}, x_{-1} > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha, x_0 < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, or $x_{-3}, x_{-2}, x_{-1} < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha, x_0 > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, or $x_{-3}, x_{-2} > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha, x_{-1}, x_0 < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, or $x_{-3}, x_{-2} < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha, x_{-1}, x_0 > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, or $x_{-3} > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha, x_{-2} < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha, x_{-1} > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha, x_0 < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$, or $x_{-3} < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha, x_{-2} > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha, x_{-1} < \bar{x}_2 = \alpha, x_0 > \bar{x}_2 = \alpha$ are embedded in the proof of the last case, and will be omitted. Therefore the proof is completed. \square

References

- [1] H. A. Abd El-Hamid, H. M. Rezk, A. M. Ahmed, G. AlNemer, M. Zakarya, H. A. El Saify, *Some dynamic Hilbert-type inequalities for two variables on time scales*, J. Inequal. Appl., **2021** 2021, 21 pages. 1, 1.5
- [2] R. Abu-Saris, C. Cinar, I. Yalçinkaya, *On the asymptotic stability of $x_{n+1} = \frac{\alpha + x_n x_{n-k}}{x_n + x_{n-k}}$* , Comput. Math. Appl., **56** (2008), 1172–1175. 1
- [3] A. M. Ahmed, *On the dynamics of a higher-order rational difference equation*, Discrete Dyn. Nat. Soc., **2011** (2011), 8 pages. 1
- [4] A. M. Ahmed, *On the Dynamics Of $x_{n+1} = \frac{\alpha + x_{n-1} x_{n-k}}{x_{n-1} + x_{n-k}}$* , J. Appl. Math. Inform., **32** (2014), 599–607. 1
- [5] A. M. Ahmed, H. M. El-Owaidy, A. Hamza, A. M. Youssef, *on the recursive sequence $x_{n+1} = \frac{\alpha + b x_{n-1}}{A + B x_n^k}$* , J. Appl. Math. Inform., **27** (2009), 275–289. 1
- [6] A. M. Ahmed, A. M. Youssef, *A solution form of a class of higher-order rational difference equations*, J. Egyptian Math. Soc., **21** (2013), 248–253.
- [7] G. AlNemer, M. Kenawy, M. Zakarya, C. Cesarano, H. M. Rezk, *Generalizations of Hardy's Type Inequalities via Conformable Calculus*, Symmetry, **13** (2021), 14 pages.
- [8] C. Cinar, *On the Positive Solutions of the Difference Equation $x_{n+1} = \frac{x_{n-1}}{1 + x_n x_{n-1}}$* , Appl. Math. Comput., **150** (2004), 21–24.
- [9] C. Cinar, *On the Difference Equation $x_{n+1} = \frac{x_{n-1}}{-1 + x_n x_{n-1}}$* , Appl. Math. Comput., **158** (2004), 813–816.
- [10] C. Cinar, *On the Positive Solutions of the Difference Equation $x_{n+1} = \frac{\alpha x_{n-1}}{1 + b x_n x_{n-1}}$* , Appl. Math. Comput., **156** (2004), 587–590.
- [11] C. Cinar, R. Karatas, I. Yalçinkaya, *On Solutions of the Difference Equation $x_{n+1} = \frac{x_{n-3}}{-1 + x_n x_{n-1} x_{n-2} x_{n-3}}$* , Math. Bohem., **132** (2007), 257–261.
- [12] E. M. Elabbasy, H. El-Metwally, E. M. Elsayed, *Qualitative Behavior of Higher Order Difference Equation*, Soochow J. Math., **33** (2007), 861–873.
- [13] E. M. Elabbasy, H. El-Metwally, E. M. Elsayed, *On the Difference Equation $x_{n+1} = \frac{\alpha_0 x_n + \alpha_1 x_{n-1} + \dots + \alpha_k x_{n-k}}{b_0 x_n + b_1 x_{n-1} + \dots + b_k x_{n-k}}$* , Math. Bohem., **133** (2008), 133–147. 1
- [14] H. El-Owaidy, A. Ahmed, A. Youssef, *On the Dynamics of $x_{n+1} = \frac{b x_{n-1}^2}{A + B x_{n-2}}$* , Rostock. Math. Kolloq., **59** (2005), 11–18. 1
- [15] H. El-Owaidy, A. Ahmed, A. Youssef, *The Dynamics of the Recursive Sequence $x_{n+1} = \frac{\alpha x_{n-1}}{\beta + \gamma x_{n-2}^p}$* , Appl. Math. Lett., **18** (2005), 1013–1018. 1
- [16] E. M. Elabbasy, H. El-Metwally, E. M. Elsayed, *On the Difference Equations $x_{n+1} = \frac{\alpha x_{n-k}}{\beta + \gamma \prod_{i=0}^k x_{n-i}}$* , J. Conc. Appl. Math., **5** (2007), 101–113. 1
- [17] E. M. Elsayed, *Dynamics of a rational recursive sequence*, Int. J. Difference Equ., **4** (2009), 185–200.
- [18] E. M. Elsayed, *Behavior of a Rational Recursive Sequences*, Stud. Univ. Babeş-Bolyai Math., **56** (2011), 27–42. 1